



NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION

Government of Meghalaya

DHS/NHM/HS/59/2023-2024 (VIII)

03.08.2023

Technical Evaluation Report for “Selection of Suitable Partner for Re-designing, Constructing and Equipping 5 Health Facilities into fully functioning FRUs in Meghalaya” by the Tender Evaluation Committee

Important Dates:

SN	RFP Details	Date	Remarks
1	Advertised	9th June, 2023	The RFP was advertised in Local, Garo and English Newspaper and one National Newspaper
2	Extended Submission Date	15th July, 2023 by 2:00 PM	
3	Opening of Technical Proposal	15th July, 2023 at 2:30 PM	
4	Presentation	25-07-2023	9.30 Am to 10.00 Am

Objective of the Project:

Maternal Health Division, Department of Family Welfare, Ministry of Health & Family, Government of India in 2004 had issued guidelines for operationalizing FIRST REFERRAL UNITS (FRUs) for strengthening Emergency Obstetric and Child Health care at the First Referral Units which are equipped to provide full range of Emergency Obstetric and New-born Care on a round-the-clock basis in addition to all emergencies that any hospital is required to provide. In the wake of increasing need to reduce maternal mortality rate, improving health interventions to hard-to-reach areas, improving health indicators and immunization in communities, setting up of FRUs has become extremely important.

NHM received a total of 3 Proposals (Technical & Financial in separate envelopes) for the above mentioned assignment, ie, 15th July, 2023. Only Technical Proposal was opened on the same date. Sealed Financial Proposals were kept separately until the opening of the Financial Proposal Date is announced.

SN	Name of Participant/ Firm
1	M/s Sandor Medicaids Pvt Ltd, 8-2-326/5, Road No. 3, Banjara Hills, Hyderabad – 500034
2	Shri. S.N. Beriwal, Howell Road, Laban, Shillong – 04, Meghalaya
3	Areng Medical Supplier, Lower Chandmari, West Garo Hills, Tura – 794001, Meghalaya

Office of Mission Director, National Health Mission

Directorate of Health Services, Health Complex, Upper New Colony, Laitumkhrah, Shillong - 793003

Phone: (0364) 2504532 Email: nrhmmegh@gmail.com



www.nrhmmeghalaya.nic.in



Nhm Meghalaya



@iecbccnhmmegh



IECBCC NHM Meghalaya



NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION

Government of Meghalaya

The 3 RFPs were jointly analyzed based on the below mentioned criteria as per RFP

SN	Criteria	Marks
1	The Bidder has experience in health-related construction and designing works in minimum last three (3) years, prior to the bid submission deadline in private or public sector	a. 03 – 05 years = 10 marks
		b. > 05-07 years = 12 marks
		c. > 7 years= 15 marks
2	The Bidder has experience in supply of medical equipment in minimum last three (3) years, prior to the bid submission deadline in private or public sector	d. 03 – 05 years = 10 marks
		e. > 05-07 years = 12 marks
		f. > 7 years= 15 marks
3	Average Annual Turnover of the Organization in any three financial years out of last five financial years ending March 2023(In case where audited result for the last preceding financial year is not available, provisional/ unaudited financial statement certified by a practicing Chartered Accountant shall also be considered acceptable.)	a. Rs. 2 crores – Rs.5 crores = 10 marks
		b. > Rs. 5 crores - Rs.7 crores = 12 marks
		c. > Rs. 7 crores = 15 marks
4	OEM Authorisation for Equipment	100% =15, 80%=10, 50%=5, <50%=0
5	A minimum number of two similar contracts (as per scope of work) that have been satisfactorily and substantially completed as a prime contractor, joint venture member, management contractor or sub- contractor in last five years [FY 17-18 to FY 22-23] prior to bid submission	a. Two Projects = 15 marks
		b. > Two Projects = 20 marks
6	Detailed Project Presentation on the understanding of the assignment, any pre-feasibility assessment conducted on field, design & reorientation plan and execution methodology.	Full Marks – 20 marks
	<i>(Marks will be allotted to the bidders on the basis of their presentation to the O/O Mission Director, NHM, and it shall be based on the evaluation of the Department) maximum no of slides should not exceed more than 5 slides with a maximum time allotment of 15 minutes.</i>	
TOTAL		100

1. On the basis of the first 5 criteria of the Evaluation, Shri. S.N. Beriwal's bid was **rejected** since he scored only **37**. The committee decided not to invite them for the presentation since it would not have made any difference to their overall score since the minimum mark for qualifying technical was kept at **60 out of 100**.
2. It was decided to invite only M/s Sandor Medicaids Pvt Ltd and Areng Medical Supplier for giving a detailed presentation on the following parameters on 25th July, 2023 from 9:30 AM to 10:00AM.

Office of Mission Director, National Health Mission

Directorate of Health Services, Health Complex, Upper New Colony, Laitumkhrah, Shillong - 793003

Phone: (0364) 2504532 Email: nrhmmegh@gmail.com

www.nrhmmeghalaya.nic.in

Nhm Meghalaya

@iecbccnhmmegh

IECBCC NHM Meghalaya



1) Understanding of the Assignment:

- (a) Please articulate your understanding of the overall objective of this assignment
- (b) Describe your perception of the desired outcomes and deliverables.

2) Pre Feasibility Assessment Conducted on Field:

- (a) Present the results of any pre-feasibility studies or assessments you have conducted on the project site or relevant areas.
- (b) Discuss the key findings and how they have influenced your project plan, designing and reorientation plan (if any).

3) Execution Methodology:

- (a) Detail the step-by-step approach you intend to follow during project execution.
- (b) Highlight key milestones, timelines, and resource allocation.

3. Over and above the given criteria and on the basis of the presentation given by the two potential firms, the committee also meticulously reviewed the entire proposal, drawings, methodology, adherence to equipment requirement and other relevant suggestions by the vendor that aligns with the project requirements through the presentation and the materials submitted. The accompanying drawings were also thoroughly examined.
4. Furthermore, the committee also took into account the valuable insights and recommendations provided by both the vendors. These suggestions were critically evaluated to gauge their potential in enhancing the proposal's overall quality and efficacy. The committee members weighed each vendor's input in the context of the project's unique requirements, striving to ensure that the final decision would lead to the most favorable outcomes. An analysis of strengths and weaknesses of both the firms are listed below:

SN	Firm Name	Strengths	Weakness
		1. Proactive approach of visiting all five health facilities and conducting a thorough assessment. This hands-on evaluation indicates their commitment to understanding the specific needs and challenges of each facility, which is crucial for tailoring solutions accordingly.	1. Finalization of a Local Contractor: The lack of a finalized local contractor



NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION

Government of Meghalaya

Draft #9 of File DHS/NHM/HS/59/2023-2024 Approved by Mission Director on 03-Aug-2023 10:48 AM - Page 4

1	M/s Sandor Medicaids Pvt Ltd	<p>2. Deep Understanding of the Assignment: The vendor's strong grasp of the project's requirements showcases their expertise in the field. Their in-depth understanding ensures that they are well-equipped to address the complexities and intricacies of the assignment effectively.</p> <p>3. Adherence to NABH Guidelines and Redesign Proposals: The focus on adhering to NABH guidelines highlights the vendor's dedication to delivering quality healthcare infrastructure. Moreover, their emphasis on redesigning all facilities to meet these standards demonstrates their commitment to providing state-of-the-art and compliant OTs and FRUs</p>	<p>for construction raises concerns about the vendor's ability to efficiently manage on-site operations. Engaging a local contractor can often lead to smoother project execution, local expertise, and better integration with regional regulations and practices.</p> <p>2. Extended Project Timeline: The vendor's request for a 4-month completion time frame instead of the desired 3 months indicates a potential delay in project delivery.</p> <p>3. Incomplete Equipment Certifications: The vendor has only provided certificates for 24 out of the 34 listed equipment items.</p>
		<p>1. Local Registered Supplier with Vast Experience: The fact that the vendor is a local registered supplier with extensive experience in both construction and supplying medical equipment to government hospitals is a major advantage. Their local presence ensures better coordination and understanding of regional regulations and requirements. Moreover, their vast experience implies a well-</p>	<p>1. Lack of Clarity on Air Filtration Compliances: The vendor's inability to provide clear and satisfactory explanation regarding the adherence to air filtration compliances for setting up OTs raises concerns about their understanding of crucial safety and hygiene measures. This lack of clarity of the concept defeats the purpose of setting up a standard OT as per NABH OT Guidelines which is the main focus point of NHM. The vendor is also</p>

Office of Mission Director, National Health Mission

Directorate of Health Services, Health Complex, Upper New Colony, Laitumkhrah, Shillong - 793003

Phone: (0364) 2504532 Email: nrhmmegh@gmail.com



www.nrhmmeghalaya.nic.in



Nhm Meghalaya



@iecbccnhmmegh



IECBCC NHM Meghalaya



NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION

Government of Meghalaya

2	Areng Medical Supplier	<p>established track record and familiarity with best practices, increasing the likelihood of successful project execution.</p> <p>2. Local Proactive approach of visiting all five health facilities and conducting a thorough assessment. This hands-on evaluation indicates their commitment to understanding the specific needs and challenges of each facility, which is crucial for tailoring solutions accordingly.</p> <p>3. Submission of OEM Certificates: The vendor's submission of OEM certificates for all 34 listed equipment is a significant strength. These certificates validate the authenticity and quality of the equipment, assuring that the healthcare facilities will receive reliable and compliant machinery.</p> <p>3. Commitment to Timely Project Completion: The vendor's commitment to completing the project within the desired 3-month timeline, barring unforeseen circumstances, is a notable strength.</p>	<p>depending on the inputs to be provided by a Hospital Consultant which they are proposing to hire.</p> <p>2. Unclear Equipment Proposals: Although OEM certificates were submitted, the vendor failed to clearly specify which equipment was being proposed for the project. This lack of clarity could lead to misunderstandings and difficulties in evaluating the suitability and compatibility of the equipment with the project's requirements.</p> <p>3. Limited Redesigning Proposals: The absence of major redesigning proposals for any of the five health facilities, despite submitting AutoCAD designs, suggests a lack of innovation and problem-solving in their approach.</p> <p>4. Insufficient Description of Guideline Adherence in Drawings: The vendor's failure to provide a clear description of how their drawings adhere to relevant guidelines raises doubts about their attention to detail and compliance with industry regulations.</p> <p>5. Recommended for construction of new building units (G+1)</p>
---	------------------------	--	--

5. On the basis of the above observations made by the committee, following points are allotted to each of the firms:

- a. M/s Sandor Medicaids Pvt Ltd - **71 out of 100. Technical Score with 80% weightage makes it 57.**
- b. Areng Medical Supplier - **74 out 100. Technical Score with 80% weightage makes it 59.**

Office of Mission Director, National Health Mission

Directorate of Health Services, Health Complex, Upper New Colony, Laitumkhrach, Shillong - 793003

Phone: (0364) 2504532 Email: nrhmmegh@gmail.com



www.nrhmmeghalaya.nic.in



Nhm Meghalaya



@iecbccnhmmegh



IECBCC NHM Meghalaya



NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION

Government of Meghalaya

(Detail Scoring is attached at ANNEXURE1)

6.The evaluation committee, having found both firms to be technically qualified, recommends proceeding to open the Financial Bids of both parties. However, the committee strongly advises conducting a meticulous evaluation of the Financial Bids to ensure alignment between the equipment lists proposed by both firms and the specific requirements of NHM. This thorough assessment is essential to prevent any potential confusions during the issuance of Work Orders and the signing of the Agreement at a later stage.

SN	Name & Designation of Tender Evaluation Committee	Signature
1	Dr H.C. Lyndem, DHS(MI)	
2	Dr L M. Umlong, Joint Director, DHS MI	
3	Dr Ranjeeta Momin, SCO, SBC, NHM	
4	Shri. Kmenbhalang Khongwir, Team Leader, MHSSP	
5	Shir. Kyrshan S Dhar, State Health Coordinator- Infrastructure, NHM & MHSSP	
6	Shri Malcolm Kharshiing, State Finance Manager, NHM	
7	Smt. M Rai, Procurement Consultant, MHSSP	

Mission Director

The document is digitally approved. Hence signature is not needed.

Office of Mission Director, National Health Mission

Directorate of Health Services, Health Complex, Upper New Colony, Laitumkhrach, Shillong - 793003

Phone: (0364) 2504532 Email: nrhmmegh@gmail.com



www.nrhmmeghalaya.nic.in



Nhm Meghalaya



@iecbccnhmmegh



IECBCC NHM Meghalaya

ANNEXURE 1

RFP for Selection of Suitable Partner for Re-designing, Constructing and Equipping 5 Health Facilities into fully functioning FRUs in Meghalaya			Participating Firms		
Sl no	Criteria	MARKS	1 SN BERIWAL	2 ARENGH	3 SANDOR
1	The Bidder has experience in health related construction and designing works in minimum last three (3) years, prior to the bid submission deadline in private or Public sector	a. 03 – 05 years = 10 marks b. > 05-07 years = 12 marks c. > 7 years= 15 marks	12	15	10
2	The Bidder has experience in supply of medical equipment in minimum last three (3) years, prior to the bid submission deadline in private or public sector	a. 03 – 05 years = 10 marks b. > 05-07 years = 12 marks c. > 7 years= 15 marks	0	15	10
3	Average Annual Turnover of the Organization in any three financial years out of last five financial years ending March 2023(In case where audited result for the last preceding financial year is not available, provisional/ unaudited financial statement certified by a practicing Chartered Accountant shall also be considered acceptable.)	a. Rs. 2 crores – Rs.5 crores = 10 marks b. > Rs. 5 crores - Rs.7 crores = 12 marks c. > Rs. 7 crores = 15 mark	15	15	15
4	OEM Authorisation for Equipment	100% =15 ,80%=10, 50%=5	10	15	5
5	A minimum number of two similar contracts (as per scope of work) that have been satisfactorily and substantially completed as a prime contractor, joint venture member, management contractor or sub- contractor in last five years [FY 17-18 to FY 22-23] prior to bid submission	a. Two Projects = 15 marks b. > Two Projects = 20 marks	0	0	15
6	Detailed Project Presentation on the understanding of the assignment, any pre-feasibility assessment conducted on field, design & reorientation plan and execution methodology. (Marks will be allotted to the bidders on the basis of their presentation to the O/O Mission Director, NHM, and it shall be based on the evaluation of the Department) maximum no of slides should not exceed more than 5 slides with a maximum time allotment of 15 minutes.	Full Marks – 20 marks	0	14	16
GRAND TOTAL		100	37	74	71
80%		80	29.6	59.2	56.8

**Dr. H. C Lyndem, DHS
(MI)**

**Dr.L M Umlong, Joint
Director,DHS (MI)**

**Dr.R Momin,SBO,SBC,
NHM**

**Shri K Khongwir,
Team Leader,MHSSP**

**Shri K Dhar,
State Health
Coordinator-**

**Shri M. Kharshiing,
State Finance
Manager,**

**Smt M. Rai,
Project Consultant,
MHSSP**

Approved by
**Ramkumar S, IAS,
MD, NHM**